2014 NEBB Annual Conference
Delivering Building Performance and Energy Efficiency
Fort Lauderdale, FL
April 3-5, 2014 – Hyatt Regency Pier 66
The Commissioning Process: What Does it Mena for Refrigerated Facilities?
What is Commissioning?

ASHRAE Guideline 0: *The Commissioning Process*

*The Commissioning Process is a quality-oriented process for achieving, verifying, and documenting that the performance of facilities, systems, and assemblies meets defined objectives and criteria.*

- 59 pages including 16 Annex providing samples of schedules, plans and checklist

ASHRAE Guideline 1.1-2007: *How to apply the Cx Process to HVAC systems*

- Describes technical requirements for applying Guideline 0
Objective of Commissioning

ASHRAE Guideline 0: *The Commissioning Process*

- Typically begins at project inception (pre-design phase)
- Verify design is to Owner’s Project Requirements (OPR)
  - OPR: Documentation of the functional requirements of a project and the expectations of how it will be used and operated
- Verify construction and system operation meets OPR
- Verify O&M personnel are properly trained on SOP’s
- Deliver a quality construction project on schedule, on budget
- Use sampling to uncover systemic problems
- Verify proper coordination among all involved

Remember these Objectives for a later comparison.
What else exists?
Industrial Refrigeration commissioning

IIAR Standard 5: Standard: Start-up and Commissioning of Closed-Circuit Ammonia Mechanical Refrigerating Systems

**Purpose:** This Standard specifies criteria and procedures for start-up and commissioning of closed-circuit ammonia mechanical refrigerating systems.

**Scope:** 2.1 Provides basic minimum requirements for the safe start-up and commissioning of completed ammonia refrigerating systems …
IIAR Standard 5

Commissioning requirements:

7.15.2 During the commissioning of the system the trained start-up technician shall involve the persons responsible for the day-to-day operation of the system.

7.15.3 The system shall be operated under the available heat load to demonstrate correct function...

7.15.4 Following the training of the system operators...and there has been a period of continuous and fault free running, the refrigeration system may be handed over...
IIAR Standard 5 requirements fall in this area.
Barriers to CxP

• What barriers prevent implementation of the Commissioning Process (CxP) for Industrial (& Commercial) Refrigeration systems?
  • What is “Commissioning” for refrigeration systems?
  • What level of commissioning necessary?
  • What level of commissioning feasible?
  • Will implementation of commissioning be a choice in the future or a requirement?
Industrial Refrigeration Systems Peculiarities

• The technology
  • Custom-engineered
    • Every system different…no “cookie cutter design”
    • System constantly growing & evolving
  • Field-erected
    • Quality/skill of installation crews highly variable
    • Uncontrolled environment for construction

• Application
  • Highly variable (e.g. food, pharmaceutical, fertilizer)
  • Many choices in operational set points
Industrial Refrigeration Systems

End user requirements
- High reliability
- Cost-effective (a.k.a. profitable)
- Flexible
- Long life (longer than most commercial systems)

System procurement options
- Design-build (95% of projects)
- Single prime contractor has primary responsibility with multiple trade or discipline-specific sub
  - Contractor heavily influences scope of work
  - Contractor may also be equipment manufacturer’s rep.
- Designed to speed project from initiation to completion
Barriers to CxP

• Contractor
  • We have 300 years combined experience!
  • We have our own internal processes to ensure our designs are flawless and fabrication is perfect.

• End-User
  • We hired a company that has a combined 300 years of experience…
  • Our project costs are high enough already! Is commissioning going to increase costs/add delay?
Opportunities for Commercial Refrigeration Cx

- “Superstores” mix together traditional retail with supermarket
  - Larger corporations familiar with Cx in their offices and stores
  - Always looking for any advantage
- California Title 20 & 24…
- New/revised AHRI standards
  - AHRI 1250
- Energy simulation software under development
Opportunities for Industrial Refrigeration Cx

**PSM**
- OSHA Process Safety Management (29 CFR 1910.119)
- Performance-based safety standard for ammonia systems above 10,000 lbs refrigerant inventory
- Smaller systems covered by “General Duty Clause”

**RMP**
- EPA Risk Management Program (40 CFR Part 68)
PSM Has 14 Elements

- Pre-startup safety review
- Process safety information
- Emergency Planning & Response
- Trade secrets
- Process hazard analysis
- Incident Investigation
- Operator training
- Operating procedures
- Compliance audits
- Contractors
- Mechanical integrity
- Management of change
- Operator training
- Employee participation
- Hot Work
PSM Has 14 Elements

- Pre-startup safety review
- Management of change
- Mechanical integrity
- Compliance audits
- Contractors
- Operator training
- Process safety information
- Emergency Planning & Response
- Hot Work
- Process hazard analysis
- Trade secrets
- Incident Investigation
- Operating procedures
- Compliance audits
- Contractors
- Operator training
Objective of Commissioning

ASHRAE Guideline 0: *The Commissioning Process*

- Typically begins at project inception (pre-design phase)
- Verify design is to Owner’s Project Requirements (OPR)
- Verify construction and system operation meets OPR
- Verify O&M personnel are properly trained on SOP’s
- Deliver a quality construction project on schedule, on budget
- Use sampling to uncover systemic problems
- Verify proper coordination among all involved
Refrigeration Cx vs. PSSR

How do PSSR and commissioning match up?

1910.119(i) Pre-Startup Safety Review

• The employer shall perform a pre-startup safety review for new facilities and for modified facilities when the modification is significant enough to require a change in the process safety information.
1910.119(i) Pre-Startup Safety Review

- The pre-startup safety review shall confirm that prior to the introduction of highly hazardous chemicals to a process:
  - Construction and equipment is in accordance with design specifications;
  - Safety, operating, maintenance, and emergency procedures are in place and are adequate;
  - For new facilities, a process hazard analysis has been performed and recommendations have been resolved or implemented before startup; and modified facilities meet the requirements contained in management of change, paragraph (l).
  - Training of each employee involved in operating a process has been completed.
Refrigeration Cx vs. MOC

How do MOC and commissioning match up?

1910.119(l) Management of change

- The employer shall establish and implement written procedures to manage changes (except for "replacements in kind") to process chemicals, technology, equipment, and procedures; and, changes to facilities that affect a covered process.
1910.119(l) Management of change

- The procedures shall assure that the following considerations are addressed prior to any change:
  - 1910.119(l)(2)(i): The *technical basis* for the proposed change;
  - 1910.119(l)(2)(iii): Modifications to *operating procedures*;
  - 1910.119(l)(3): Employees involved in operating a process and maintenance and contract employees whose job tasks will be affected by a change in the process shall be *informed of, and trained in*, the change prior to start-up of the process or affected part of the process.
Refrigeration Cx vs. MI

What is the relationship between MI and commissioning?

1910.119(j)(6)(i) Mechanical Integrity – Quality Assurance

- In the construction of new plants and equipment, the employer shall assure that equipment as it is fabricated is suitable for the process application for which they will be used.
Commissioning vs. PSM?

- Commissioning:
  - Suitable materials
  - Technical basis for change
  - Modifications to SOP
  - Training
  - Time period

- MOC:

- PSSR:
  - Meet design
  - SOP’s
  - Training
Examples

Is this refrigerant piping properly supported?
Examples

Result of implementing improper sequences of control on a brand new installation.

A formal commissioning process could have prevented this incident!
Examples

Inadequate planning of pipe and insulation routing results in improper installation practices.

Inadequate planning of pipe routing that accounts for insulation thickness.

A formal commissioning process may have caught this defect.
Inadequate planning of pipe routing that accounts for insulation thickness.

A formal commissioning process may have caught this defect.
Industry Refrigeration Systems

CxP Challenges

- No equipment performance standards
  - Compressors, condensers, evaporators, pumps, valves, controls
- Diffuse design guidance
- Dynamic nature of owner requirements
- Many doing design are without any credentials
  - Engineering degree
  - Professional license
- Construction project managers may not have essential skills
  - Primarily concerned with schedule and budget
- Lack of enforcement of project scope
  - Construction defects allowed
  - Poor workmanship tolerated
  - Little or no project documentation (PSM-related)
Benefits of CxP

- Improved articulation of owner requirements
- Refrigeration systems that are:
  - Safer
  - A better match for the project requirements
  - Cost-effective
  - More efficient
  - Less start up issues
  - Easier and less problems to integrate
- Capable of delivering what the owner requested
What does the future hold for IR commissioning?

- Development of a IR CxP Standard?
- Expansion of ASHRAE’s Cx Guidelines?
  - Refrigeration Commissioning Guide published
  - Provides how to information on how to apply the CxP to commercial refrigeration systems.
  - Some refrigerated warehouse/industrial refrigeration systems have utilized a streamlined version of CxP
- Development of Cx Guidelines by others?
- Implementing CxP will have to be driven by end-users…or regulators
Questions?

Innovation – Knowledge – Progress

www.irc.wisc.edu